

## Virtual Collaboration Tool Comparison for the Technology of Participation (ToP)®

CW Essentials	Pattern of Collaboration	Affordances	Features	Eliminate Benefits	Eliminate Cons	Eliminate Score	Facilitate.com Benefits	Facilitate.com Cons	Facilitate.com Score	GroupMind Benefits
1) Set context with a flip chart	Communicate	Communicate ideas on a flip chart to a group	Create a flip chart with text and images	Use PPT slide or blank whiteboard		4	Use flip chart	Requires a little HTML knowledge to add a logo	2	Use flip chart
2) Brainstorm ideas individually	Generate	Brainstorm ideas individually	Individuals record ideas to share electronically		Requires each person to be in own breakout room	1	Stable, title + detail, easy to move to next step		4	Stable cards
3) Send teams into breakout rooms	Access	Create breakout rooms with visual & audio components	Create breakout rooms in variety of ways	Can breakout on the fly, multiple people per room	No set-up of breakout rooms til open live session	3	Can set-up breakout rooms in advance	Hard to breakout on the fly due to advance set-up	2	Can set-up breakout rooms in advance
4) Brainstorm ideas in pairs or small teams	Generate	Brainstorm ideas in pairs or small teams	Small teams share ideas and generate new ideas		Hard to transfer cards, unstable formatting of cards	1	Easy to edit, delete, add new ideas to the brainstorm		4	Stable cards
5) Facilitator monitors breakout rooms	Access	Monitor and assist activity in breakout rooms	Leader can wander between breakout rooms	See and hear breakout activity with one movement		4		Must orchestrate phone and internet separately	2	
6) Teams reduce ideas to the specified number	Reduce	Reduce brainstormed ideas to a specified number	Highlight an individual's or team's best ideas	Move cards into accept/reject clusters	Requires dexterity	2	Easy to delete ideas, and mark ideas		4	
7) Team marks "Round No."; fac. moves cards	Organize	Team can "pass up" cards in 3 rounds	Possible to mark cards, move some on, retain rest		Unstable process, requires dexterity and know-how	2	Participants write Round No, facilitators move cards		4	
8) Read the cards and clarify meaning	Clarify	Read and clarify idea cards and title cards	Adequate space for descriptions, easy to change		Hard to edit, unstable, nonstandardized cards	2	Clarify ideas w/ details, easy edit		4	
9) Cluster cards in three rounds	Organize	Group visualizes what its thinking by forming clusters	Cluster and recluster ideas into groups	Visually very similar to a sticky wall	Requires 2nd facilitator	2	Facilitator clusters, no refresh req'd by participants		4	Facilitator clusters
10) Give tag names and then titles to clusters	Reduce	Abstract a concept by tagging and naming clusters	Give titles to clusters		Unstable, not enough space, 2nd facilitator req'd	1	Facilitator configures, no refresh req'd by participants	Only trained participants can support this function	4	Facilitator configures
11) Cluster at a higher level	Organize	Group forms high-level or overarching clusters	Cluster named clusters into high level clusters		Lack of space; move titles only to a new whiteboard	1	Move titles & cards to new chart to cluster at next level		4	Transport titles only to new tool for clustering
12) Name the high level clusters	Reduce	Abstract new concepts by naming titles clustered tog.	Give titles to clustered named clusters		Lack of space; move titles only to a new whiteboard	1	Easy to write 80 character or detailed title		4	
13) Resolve with a focused conversation	Form a Gestalt	Form a new gestalt around a set of data with a group	Arrange cards on 1 screen in a particular arrangement		Maximum 30-40 cards per screen, hard to move cards	1	Able to see all levels of cards and titles	1 vertical column only, slide down screen to see all	2	Unlimited ideas & clusters, two columns
<b>AVERAGE SCORE FOR CONSENSUS WORKSHOP AFFORDANCES</b>						<b>1.9</b>			<b>3.4</b>	
	Access	Avoid security clearance issues with networked orgs	No downloads required to access the tool		Download required, time-consuming, troublesome	0	No downloads required		4	No downloads required
	Access	Built-in plan B when computer technology fails	Redundancy of technology in case of technology failure		Internet or computer failure are catastrophic to session	0	Internet + phone redundant; reduce bandwidth req't		4	Internet + phone redundant; reduce bandwidth req't
	Access	Log-in both first time and ongoing are super simple	Simple audio connection allows talk-thru of log-in		Complex log-in since audio comes onstream after log-in	0	Audio is simple allowing talk-thru of computer log-in		4	Audio is simple allowing talk-thru of computer log-in
	Access	Read link over phone when can't find email instructions	Context sensitive link easy to read over the phone		Long, complex link requires finding an email to access	1	Context sensitive link easy to read over phone		4	Context sensitive link easy to read over phone
	Access	Requires no technology training for participants	Very intuitive interface to operate features		Participants require 1 hour technology training to begin	0	Usability is intuitive, easy to train while using tool		4	
	Build Commitment	See a visual image of what the group is thinking	Graphical images of data with nuances by category			0			0	Variety of graphical images depict group's thoughts

Features  
 4 = Excellent Functionality  
 3 = Above Average Functionality  
 2 = Average Functionality  
 1 = Below Average Functionality  
 0 = No functionality

Affordances  
 Green = Most Affordances  
 Yellow = Some Affordances  
 Red = Almost No Affordances

## Virtual Collaboration Tool Comparison for the Technology of Participation (ToP)®

CW Essentials	Pattern of Collaboration	Affordances	Features	Illuminate Benefits	Illuminate Cons	Illuminate Score	Facilitate.com Benefits	Facilitate.com Cons	Facilitate.com Score	GroupMind Benefits
	Build Trust	Get an image of who is on the call	Visual image of who is on the call	All participants see a list of who is on the call		3		Only facilitator can see who's actually on the call	2	Sign-in enables all to see who is on the call
	Build Trust	Get contact information about the team	Access to contact information of teammates	Wave cursor over name to see photo, data	Can't print out team data	2	Creation of team contact data with photo possible		3	Creation of team contact data with photo possible
	Communicate	Alternative to audio to speed-up communication	Chat is directable to participants, savable	Chat is in main screen, able to export to a report		4	Chat is optional, can be turned into flip chart	Chat is standalone, can't be used next to other tools	1	
	Communicate	High audio quality, minimal background noise	Engineered sound quality	Talking stick mic minimizes overtalking & bkgnd noise		3			0	
	Communicate	Minimal confusion about whose turn to talk	Leader can call on people and pass the microphone		Acquisition of talking stick behavior takes time	2			0	
	Communicate	Observe nonverbal communication	Visual communication of nonverbal communication	Nonverbal emoticons are large and recognizable	Record and search to find the record	4			0	
	Communicate	Play recordings from variety of devices	Convert recording for iPod or MP3 player			4			0	
	Communicate	Reduce memory needs	Convert recording to high def video or audio podcast	Post it to your own website, retain it indefinitely		4			0	
	Communicate	Replay classes to catch-up or review	Record synchronized visual and audio for playback	Visual and audio are combined in one tool		4			0	
	Communicate	See live visual image of speaker	Live video display of speakers		Consumes bandwidth, low quality image	3			0	
	Communicate	See who is present in the meeting by name	Moderator / participant listing by name	Facilitators and participants are able to see names		4	Facilitator is able to see participant names	Participants are not able to see other participants	3	Facilitator and participants are both able to see names
	Communicate	Share information by video	Show YouTube videos	Watch video together synchronously		4	Can create a link to watch asynchronously		2	Can create a link to watch asynchronously
	Communicate	Share information created by the presenter	Slideshow presentation using PowerPoint	Able to write on slides, export to meeting report	Unable to upload before meeting is live	4	Can create a download to watch asynchronously		2	User-friendly pre-load, participants add comments
	Communicate	Share information from a website	Open and browse websites	Leader can guide participants around the site		4	Can create a link to websites		2	Can create a link to websites
	Educate	Reinforce and double-check what students learn	Quizzes and tests	Built-in test functionality		4	Could use survey tool	Not sure about scoring capability	2	Could use survey tool
	Evaluate	Quickly discern the opinion or decision of the group	Visual communication of opinion	Instant-polling emoticons require no advance set-up	Record and search to find the record of a vote	2	A variety of voting and polling tools with a record	Requires advance set-up	2	A variety of voting and polling tools with a record

Features  
 4 = Excellent Functionality  
 3 = Above Average Functionality  
 2 = Average Functionality  
 1 = Below Average Functionality  
 0 = No functionality

Affordances  
 Green = Most Affordances  
 Yellow = Some Affordances  
 Red = Almost No Affordances

## Virtual Collaboration Tool Comparison for the Technology of Participation (ToP)®

Pattern of Collaboration	Affordances	GroupMind Cons	GroupMind Score	MaestroConf Benefits	MaestroConf Cons	MaestroConf Score
Communicate	Communicate ideas on a flip chart to a group	Editing can be a bit unstable	2			0
Generate	Brainstorm ideas individually	Complex set-up and instructions	2			0
Access	Create breakout rooms with visual & audio components	Hard to breakout on the fly due to advance set-up	2	Automatically or by polling, multiple people per room		4
Generate	Brainstorm ideas in pairs or small teams	Complex set-up and instructions	2			0
Access	Monitor and assist activity in breakout rooms	Must orchestrate phone and internet separately	2	Easy to wander the breakout rooms		4
Reduce	Reduce brainstormed ideas to a specified number		0			0
Organize	Team can "pass up" cards in 3 rounds	Awkward process	1			0
Clarify	Read and clarify idea cards and title cards	Challenging to edit, no high level/detailed description	2			0
Organize	Group visualizes what its thinking by forming clusters	Awkward especially in first round, ideas get renumbered	2			0
Reduce	Abstract a concept by tagging and naming clusters	Only trained participants can support, refresh req'd by part	3			0
Organize	Group forms high-level or overarching clusters	Lose the detailed cards	1			0
Reduce	Abstract new concepts by naming titles clustered tog.	Awkward to edit titles	1			0
Form a Gestalt	Form a new gestalt around a set of data with a group	Slide down screen to see all	2			0
<b>AVERAGE SCORE FOR CONSENSUS WORKSHOP AFFORDANCES</b>			<b>1.7</b>			<b>0.6</b>
Access	Avoid security clearance issues with networked orgs		4		Leader can't penetrate corp network (working on fix)	3
Access	Built-in plan B when computer technology fails		4			0
Access	Log-in both first time and ongoing are super simple		4	Access by telephone is simple and virtually no fail		4
Access	Read link over phone when can't find email instructions		3			NA
Access	Requires no technology training for participants	Usability requires training, but can be done while using tool	2	Usability is intuitive, easy to train while using tool		4
Build Commitment	See a visual image of what the group is thinking		4			0

Features  
 4 = Excellent Functionality  
 3 = Above Average Functionality  
 2 = Average Functionality  
 1 = Below Average Functionality  
 0 = No functionality

Affordances  
 Green = Most Affordances  
 Yellow = Some Affordances  
 Red = Almost No Affordances

## Virtual Collaboration Tool Comparison for the Technology of Participation (ToP)®

Pattern of Collaboration	Affordances	GroupMind Cons	<u>GroupMind Score</u>	MaestroConf Benefits	MaestroConf Cons	<u>MaestroConf Score</u>
Build Trust	Get an image of who is on the call		2	Only facilitator sees who is on the call		2
Build Trust	Get contact information about the team		3			0
Communicate	Alternative to audio to speed-up communication		0			0
Communicate	High audio quality, minimal background noise		0	Extraordinary audio clarity even with calls > 200 people		4
Communicate	Minimal confusion about whose turn to talk		0	Leader sees list of names, able to ask for raised hands		4
Communicate	Observe nonverbal communication		0	Simple polling with telephone requires no set-up	Remember to transfer to chat to record	3
Communicate	Play recordings from variety of devices		0	Recording for MP3 player available		4
Communicate	Reduce memory needs		0	Download recording w/ breakouts (blanks) removed		4
Communicate	Replay classes to catch-up or review		0			0
Communicate	See live visual image of speaker		0			0
Communicate	See who is present in the meeting by name	Requires an awkward sign-in procedure	2	Facilitator is able to see participant names	Participants are not able to see other participants	3
Communicate	Share information by video		2		Limited to audio clips only	1
Communicate	Share information created by the presenter	Cannot write on the slide during presentation	3			0
Communicate	Share information from a website		2			0
Educate	Reinforce and double-check what students learn	Scoring is challenging	2	Could ask a question at a time and use polling feature		1
Evaluate	Quickly discern the opinion or decision of the group	Requires advance set-up	2	Simple polling with telephone requires no set-up	Remember to transfer to chat to record	2

**Features**

- 4 = Excellent Functionality
- 3 = Above Average Functionality
- 2 = Average Functionality
- 1 = Below Average Functionality
- 0 = No functionality

**Affordances**

- Green = Most Affordances
- Yellow = Some Affordances
- Red = Almost No Affordances